

1 **Micromechanics of Quartz Sand Breakage in a Fractal Context**

2 **Arya ASSADI LANGROUDI** (Corresponding Author),

3 Doctoral Researcher, School of Civil Engineering, University of Birmingham,

4 Edgbaston, Birmingham, B15 2TT, United Kingdom

5 Email: Arya.assadi@gmail.com

6 **Ian JEFFERSON** (Alternative Corresponding Author)

7 Reader, School of Civil Engineering, University of Birmingham

8 Email: i.jefferson@bham.ac.uk

9 **Kenneth O'HARA-DHAND**

10 Honorary Visiting Fellow, Department of Geology, University of Leicester,

11 University Road, Leicester, LE1 7RH, United Kingdom

12 Email: kohdhand@gmail.com

13 **Ian J. SMALLEY**

14 Honorary Professor, Department of Geology, University of Leicester

15 Email: smalley@loessletter.co.uk

16

17

18

19 **Abstract:**

20 From a Quaternary science perspective, sand-sized quartz as well as silt-sized quartz is often  
21 acknowledged as final products of glacial abrasion through different evolution mechanisms. This view  
22 challenges the existence of any universal comminution process, which may relate the formation of detrital  
23 quartz sand and silt. The contribution of grain size, energy input, and crystalline integrity in the scale of  
24 quartz crushability has long been matter of much debate. The present empirical work examines the  
25 micromechanics of sand-to-silt size reduction in the quartz material. A series of grinding experiments was  
26 performed on Leighton Buzzard Lower Greensand using a high-energy disc mill. Analogous conditions to  
27 glacial abrasion are provided due to the combined abrasion between grains' asperity tips, and also  
28 between grains and rotating smooth tungsten carbide pestle. Discontinuous breakage approach allowed  
29 a control on grains' crystalline defects. To enable an objective assessment of micromechanics of size  
30 reduction, measurements of particle and mode size distribution, fractal indexes and micro-morphological  
31 signatures were made. The crushing approach was probed through varied grinding time at a constant  
32 energy input, as well as varied energy input at constant grinding time. Breakage pathway was inspected  
33 via laser diffraction spectroscopy and transmission light microscopy. Results suggested that the grain  
34 breakdown is not necessarily an energy-dependent process. Non-crystallographically pure quartz sand  
35 and silt are inherently breakable materials through a fractal breakdown process. Results also revealed  
36 that the internal defects in quartz are independent from size and energy input.

37 **Key words:**

38 Quartz; breakage; fractal; micromechanics; glacial

39

40 **1. Introduction**

41 Loess, for which silt is the main constituent, is formed through cycles of Quaternary geologic (e.g.  
42 crystallization of magma), geomorphic (e.g. solifluction or cryoturbation) and climatic (e.g. thermal or  
43 chemical weathering) processes (Smalley et al., 2006 b). A good understanding of loess needs silt to  
44 receive a descent deal of attention. Silt grains' texture, size, sorting, and crystalline structure have prime  
45 control on their interaction with clay, chemicals, and capillary water bonds. Silts' resistance against  
46 skeletal forces is also a factor of grains' surficial and internal properties. (i.e the main supporting units for  
47 open spaces within the soil's structure). As such, the purpose of this paper is to make a contribution to  
48 that understanding, and to look at the quartz size reduction in the sedimentary environment and the  
49 controls involved. Silt is formed through size reduction mechanisms. Jefferson et al. (1997) discussed a  
50 set of natural geochemical controls in silt formation from quartz-bearing igneous and metamorphic rocks.  
51 These controls commenced with an initial transformation of 'high quartz ( $\beta$ -quartz)' into the more densely  
52 packed 'low quartz ( $\alpha$ -quartz or ordinary quartz)' upon cooling to the hydrothermal temperatures in a  
53 granitic system.  $\beta$ -quartz forms after slow crystallization of siliceous ( $\text{SiO}_2$ -rich) magma. Sorby (1858)  
54 made a detailed study of quartz origin, and implicated the liquid inclusions in quartz to a history of slow  
55 crystallization of siliceous magma of granite at low heat (i.e. to a degree beyond  $573^\circ\text{C}$ ) but under great  
56 pressure. The quartz product is in fact a part of a coarse eutectic of quartz and feldspar (Smalley, 1966).  
57 This eutectic reaction which delivers two new phases from one original phase leaves its footprints as that  
58 showed later herein (se Fig. 4 in section 4). Further temperature decrease allows the structure of high  
59 quartz to distort; such that 6-fold and 3-fold screw axes ( $60^\circ$  and  $120^\circ$  inclination) change into 3-fold screw  
60 axes ( $60^\circ$  inclination). Oxygen-Silicon bonds kinks and bends, which provides a more densely packed  
61 assemblage. The transformation from 'high quartz' to 'low quartz' is displacive (i.e. no bond breakage  
62 occurs), but the angle between oxygen bonds' change. This causes contraction in the crystal. Contraction  
63 induces tensile stresses, normal to the c-axis (about which quartz contracts). These stresses fracture the  
64 crystal or induce a defect plane along the c-axis (Smalley, 1966). The defects led to crushing, delivering

65 600  $\mu\text{m}$  modal particles into the sedimentary system. According to Blatt (1970), this 600 to 700  $\mu\text{m}$  quartz  
66 was further crushed by 90%. The breakage resulted a pronounced mode size of 60 $\mu\text{m}$ . The 60  $\mu\text{m}$  silt was  
67 further crushed into a pronounced mode size of 20 to 60  $\mu\text{m}$  (Kumar et al., 2006) and then to 20 to 30  $\mu\text{m}$   
68 (Jefferson et al., 1997). A control is shall exist on the breakdown process under moderate natural stresses  
69 (Jefferson et al., 1997).

70 Mechanism of quartz size reduction has been explained in a fractal framework (Hyslip and Vallejo, 1997;  
71 Mandelbrot, 1983). The use of fractal concept allows the simultaneous quantification of fragmentation  
72 and grain size distribution (Hyslip and Vallejo, 1997). Fragmentation (i.e. quartz size reduction) is a scale  
73 invariant natural process (Smalley et al., 2005), which is conventionally quantified by means of fractal  
74 concept (Turcotte, 1986). Fractal is basically a power law relation between number (particles' population  
75 by mass) and size (particle's diameter). Central to the fractal concept is the fractal dimension, which is a  
76 measure of the fracture resistance properties of dispersed systems (Brown et al., 1996), such as the  
77 crystalline defects in quartz sand and silt. A fractal dimension is a ratio providing a statistical index of  
78 complexity comparing how detail in a pattern (strictly speaking, a fractal pattern) changes with the scale  
79 at which it is measured. It has also been characterized as a measure of the space-filling capacity of a  
80 pattern that tells how a fractal scales differently than the space it is embedded in; a fractal dimension  
81 does not have to be an integer.

82 Lu et al. (2003) used the particle size distribution data to characterise the fractal properties of Leighton  
83 Buzzard sand. They assumed a uniform shape of particles, which is arguable in loess soils (Howarth, 2010;  
84 Rogers and Smalley, 1993). They then used the Schuhmann's distribution (Fuerstenau, 2003) accompanied  
85 with (Turcotte, 1986) relation (between the fractal dimension and distribution index as discussed in  
86 section 4) and successfully described the fragmentation events. Fractal dimension however should be  
87 derived separately for clay and quartz minerals (Wang et al., 2008), due to the different origin of primary

88 and clay minerals (Posadas et al., 2001). This however does not apply to the clean crushed Leighton  
89 Buzzard sand, as this material contains no mineralogical gradient among its size scales.

90 The present empirical work examines the micromechanics of sand-to-silt size reduction in the quartz  
91 material. A series of grinding experiments was performed on Leighton Buzzard Lower Greensand using a  
92 high-energy disc mill. Analogous conditions to glacial abrasion are reportedly provided in disc mills due to  
93 the combined abrasion between grains' asperity tips, and also between grains and rotating smooth  
94 tungsten carbide pestle. The grinding time and energy input were varied. Breakage pathway was  
95 inspected via Laser diffraction spectroscopy and transmission light microscopy. Arithmetic fractal  
96 measures to describe the breakage process were recorded. These included fractal dimension, relative  
97 breakage index, maximum grain size, pronounced mode size and sorting. Results from the grinding  
98 experiments together with the microscopy examinations were utilised to derive a timeline for the sand-  
99 to-silt size reduction phenomena.

## 100 **2. Current Understanding of Silt Pedogenesis**

101 Silt is a product of events in Peridesert, Perimountain, and Periglacial environments (Smith et al., 2002).  
102 Peridesert silt is generated from chemical and salt weathering (Pye, 1995), temperature fluctuations  
103 (Smalley et al., 2001) and seasonal wetting/drying and heating/cooling (Smith et al., 2002). Perimountain  
104 silt is generated from cold weathering (Zourmpakis et al., 2003) and frost shattering (Wright et al., 1998).  
105 Periglacial silt is produced from glacial grinding (Smalley et al., 2005) of granitic (Sorby, 1858) beds of  
106 glaciers. Less appreciated disintegrating processes include: sub-aerial and fluvial transport actions  
107 (Smalley et al., 2006 a), loessification (i.e. in-situ dry weathering on carbonate rich parent material that  
108 originally was deposited as alluvium on flood plains during Pleistocene – see Russell (1944) and Pecsli  
109 (1990)) and dry climate weathering (Assallay et al., 1996), desertification (Qiang et al., 2010), and volcanic

110 actions (Pouclet et al., 1999). However, glacial grinding (Periglacial) is widely accepted as the main source  
111 of present-day silt (Smalley et al., 2006 a).

## 112 *2.1 Geological Controls and Sand-to-Silt Size Reduction*

113 The significance of internal weakness in quartz was first scientifically described by (Moss, 1966). In the  
114 line of an earlier research work of Wright and Larsen (1909), Moss (1966) classified the quartz into mature  
115 (intact) and defected types. Mature quartz has a background of less post-solidification modifications and  
116 fracturing-healing cycles, contains more non-undulatory extinction features and is less structurally  
117 damaged. This background grants mature quartz a considerable resistance to weathering, high durability  
118 and hardness. With non-intact quartz, cracks formed along the projected lines of internal defected planes,  
119 such as unopened healed fractures. In 1973, Moss showed the contribution of transient loads in grain  
120 breakage. He emphasised that the magnitude of applying static load might not be high enough to trigger  
121 the breakage. The transient load of the same magnitude, however, could crush the grain. He differentiated  
122 the grain breakage under transient loading environments by using the 'fatigue fracturing' term.' Moss  
123 (1966) showed that controlled-rate cyclic loads of low order can crush the granitic quartz, while static  
124 loads of the same value may fail to break a similar grain. He then simulated a fluvial transport system by  
125 subjecting the granitic quartz to rotation in a steel drum containing water. Quartz was weakened in the  
126 long-term in transient loading environment (i.e. waves and streams). The 'mean fragmentation load' (i.e.  
127 load required to trigger the breakage) remarkably decreased by the end of the early rotation runs,  
128 highlighting the fatigue weakening of quartz grains. This agreed with Sharp and Gomez (1986) suggestion  
129 that grains break through both fatigue and surface fracturing. Fatigue effect was also addressed in  
130 Rabinowicz (1976), where certain textural features were linked with splitting events as stresses apply and  
131 release. The idea of silt production through fatigue fracturing in fluvial systems however was questioned  
132 in the work of Wright and Smith (1993). They reported small amounts produced in the range 2 to 20  $\mu\text{m}$   
133 silts by water-quartz abrasion. They showed the higher significance of impact-induced fracturing than

134 fatigue fracturing. They produced considerable mass of 20 to 60  $\mu\text{m}$  grains by using rigid ceramic spheres  
135 in the rotating drum. In a different attempt, air-abrasion was simulated in Smith et al. (1991), by subjecting  
136 350 to 500  $\mu\text{m}$  sized Pannonian sand to air jet stream for 1 to 128 hours, generating remarkable contents  
137 of 20  $\mu\text{m}$  grains in the first hour. Microscopic observations showed strong edge grinding (source of 20  $\mu\text{m}$   
138 fines) and appearance of fresh micro-fractures on large grains during the first hour. A secondary  
139 pronounced mode appeared after 16 hours at 20 to 40  $\mu\text{m}$ , which then changed into 60  $\mu\text{m}$ . Similar results  
140 were reported in Wright et al. (1998). The stepwise size reduction was in a good agreement with the  
141 fatigue fracturing concept. Jefferson et al. (1997) discussed the significance of quartz internal controls in  
142 air-abrasion processes. They quoted two similar wind tunnel experiments on two different sand materials  
143 (crystallographically perfect quartz in Kuenen (1960) and granitic quartz in Whalley et al. (1982)). Little silt  
144 was generated by crushing the crystallographically perfect quartz. Wright (1995) simulated the glacial  
145 grinding at the base of glaciers, by using a Bromhead ring shear. The ring shear was used for its closer  
146 approximation to subglacial environments than tumbling mills. After subjecting 250 to 500  $\mu\text{m}$  freshly  
147 crushed (to simulate an identical stress history for entire grains according to Wright and Smith (1993))  
148 Brazilian vein quartz to rotation under varying axial loads, Wright (1995) reported no evidence of fresh  
149 micro-cracks in grains. The little produced silt fitted well into the common loess size range, 20 to 60  $\mu\text{m}$ .  
150 She then questioned the predominant contribution of quartz breakage at clast-bedrock interfaces in  
151 Pleistocene glaciers in silt production. Wright (1995) concluded a number of possible factors to explain  
152 the limited size reduction recorded in the majority of her experiments. She referred to findings of Bond  
153 (1952) and Rittinger (1867) that acknowledged a relatively higher energy required for fine sand-to-silt size  
154 reduction. This however was argued in (Jefferson et al., 1997; Kumar et al., 2006). These works showed  
155 significant contents of produced silt, after grinding 1 to 2 mm Leighton Buzzard quartz sand with a high-  
156 energy disc mill. They also showed two early and late periods of breakage at which easily breakable flawed  
157 and crystalline defected hard particles crushed, respectively. Assallay (1998) used a range of grinding

158 machines to simulate different breakage processes. He postulated that the end runner mill simulates the  
159 glacial grinding, ball mill simulates the particle impact, and compression machine simulates the natural  
160 compression forces. The ball mill (Assallay, 1998) is a much more gentle process than the disc mill. Assallay  
161 1998 used the end-runner mill to grind the same material used in Jefferson et al. (1997). He reported that  
162 sand-sized fragments were crushed by 70% in size to 10 to 50  $\mu\text{m}$  silts by the end of 2-hour grinding period.  
163 Kumar et al. (2006) examined the earlier work of Wright (1995) by repeating the same testing procedure  
164 on un-weathered vein quartz and marine Leighton Buzzard sand. They concluded that the little produced  
165 silt from un-weathered vein quartz is due to the absence of crystalline internal defects, and not a factor  
166 of the initial grain size.

## 167 *2.2 Micromechanics of Sand-to-Silt Size Reduction*

168 Moss (1973) developed one of the earliest quartz breakage models. He attributed the edge grinding to  
169 concentration of stresses at grains' asperity tips, which provides greater chance for grain to split.  
170 Generated fine fragments fill the void spaces and overflow thereafter around survived larger particles. He  
171 postulated a higher chance of breakage in relatively large particles (in agreement with Sharp and Gomez  
172 (1986)), due to presence of higher degrees of internal imperfections. Recently, Bolton (1999) investigated  
173 the micromechanics of crushable grains. He revealed that a grain's resistant is a factor of the contact  
174 constraint conditions, particle size, and level of applied internal stress. He drew the attention to the higher  
175 tendency of smaller particles to split (in contrast with Moss (1973)). Small grains get trapped between  
176 neighbouring larger grains and attain the maximum chance of splitting in presence of two point contacts.  
177 Relatively finer grains carry the same force over a smaller surface area (Also see (Mitchell and Soga, 2005;  
178 Santamarina, 2003)) and therefore are subjected to higher levels of internal stresses. Coop and Altuhafi  
179 (2011) agreed with Bolton (1999), and emphasised that well sorted grains break more readily. This was  
180 ascribed to the increased number of grains' contacts, which favours the edge grinding and fine crushing.



181 As a summary to the brief silt literature discussed above, it may be well to point out that there are  
182 questions of the quartz size reduction – a question of breakability of sand and silt and a question of  
183 controls on the size and population of the silt output. The present study allows for the sand-to-clay size  
184 reduction timeline to develop. Reading the microscopy examination results together with the measured  
185 fractal indexes on this breakdown timeline is expected to answer the two questions.

### 186 **3. Testing Set-up and Material**

187 Washed oven-dried Leighton Buzzard Lower Greensand quartz from Bedfordshire was mechanically  
188 ground in a high-energy Siebtechnik disc mill. The disc mill consisted of a barrel, which accommodates a  
189 ring and a tungsten carbide pestle. By means of predominantly horizontal vibrations, the material was  
190 ground by impact and friction. Milling took place from the impact between the pestle and the ring, and  
191 also between the ring and the inner wall of the barrel, crushing any material trapped in between.  
192 Furthermore, particle-to-particle abrasion and crushing of materials trapped underneath the pestle and  
193 the ring were other modes of milling. Analogous conditions to glacial abrasion are provided in disc mills  
194 (Jefferson et al., 1997) due to the combined abrasion between grains' asperity tips, and also between  
195 grains and rotating smooth tungsten carbide pestle.

196 Sand was initially washed with tap water (and then Calgon) through a 63  $\mu\text{m}$  sieve to remove the silt- and  
197 clay-sized fragments (fine quartz and clay minerals) before operating the grinding experiments. This  
198 allowed an accurate control on the mass of 'silt' production for a given energy input. A series of timed  
199 events with each grind time (up to 60 s) followed by a 30 s cooling period to prevent overheating. The  
200 discontinuous grinding regime (frequent stress application and release) controlled the internal fatigue  
201 stresses. In addition to the grinding duration, the magnitude of the energy input has a significant control  
202 on the silt output. A control on the feed mass (mass of the original sand inside the barrel) was used to  
203 imitate two input energies. The barrel could hold up to 360 g of Leighton Buzzard sand, the full capacity

204 of which were used initially. The sand mass was then reduced by 30%. This was felt to give greater impact  
205 energy as particles were allowed to move back and forth easier, in a given grinding timescale.

206 Using the disc mill allowed control on the length of grinding and cooling periods. The discontinuity of  
207 grinding allows the control on the fatigue stresses and therefore activation of crystalline discontinuities  
208 (Jefferson et al., 1997). However, this differs compared to the governing conditions under glaciers and  
209 other natural silt producing systems (Kumar et al., 2006).

210 After grinding, crushed material was carefully placed in sealed and labelled plastic bags to determine the  
211 particle size distribution (PSD) through the laser diffraction (LD) spectroscopy technique. Size analysis by  
212 LD however posed uncertainties (O'Hara-Dhand et al., 2013) with the population of  $<2.5\mu\text{m}$  grains (slight  
213 over-estimation) and the size of  $>50\mu\text{m}$  grains (under-estimation after the cross-checking data obtained  
214 from the standard gravity sedimentation – also see Pye and Blott (2004)). Uncertainties were deemed  
215 mainly due the coagulation of sub-rounded fine grains on the vibrating channel before the laser analysis  
216 and also the fact that LD machines assume all particles as perfect spheres. Other sources of errors could  
217 be the small sample sizes, which might not be a true representation of the test material (Cooper, 1998).  
218 On the plus side, grading outputs produced by the LD technique are highly reproducible (Abbireddy and  
219 Clayton, 2009).

220 Small samples taken after each set of grinding were viewed under optical microscopes (Leica DM LM  
221 optical and light transmission Zeiss Axioplan 2 petrological microscope). Light microscopy allows the study  
222 of crystalline features by transmitting the light through the grain samples. However, light microscopy  
223 imposes drawbacks to the results: the poor magnification and the low resolution. Furthermore, this  
224 approach does not allow the real-time observation of grains' modification. However, the test material was  
225 ground in a closed system and no crushed material was removed from the system before a subsequent  
226 round of grinding. As the sand fraction was completely crushed after 180 s of grinding, the observed

227 surface imperfections in crushed grains were concluded to differ from textural features of grains at their  
228 initial stage.

## 229 **4. Results and Discussion**

### 230 *4.1 Fractal Features of Breakdown Timeline*

231 Hardin equation for relative breakage index (Hardin, 1985) was used to describe the size-reduction in  
232 quantitative terms. According to Hardin (1985) 'Breakage potential',  $B_p$ , is the area above the initial  
233 grading curve up to the '100% passing' line, confined between the lower-bound 63  $\mu\text{m}$  and the upper-  
234 bound maximum grains' diameter (as for sand-size index) or the 2  $\mu\text{m}$  lower- and 63  $\mu\text{m}$  upper-bounds  
235 (as for silt-size index). The 'Total breakage',  $B_t$ , underlines the amount of crushing that the granular  
236 assembly has undergone and is represented by the area between the PSD curve pair of the initial and  
237 post-crushed state, while confined in the latter span of  $B_p$ . The relative breakage is defined as the ratio of  
238  $B_t$  over  $B_p$ . To derive the associated areas, the fitted functions of each grading curve were integrated along  
239 the particle size axis. Fig. 1 shows the relative breakage index for silt-sized and sand-sized scales against  
240 grinding time.

241 [Figure 1]

242 At sand-sized scale, there was a gradual rise in the breakage index in 0-120 s timescale from zero to just  
243 under 5%. Index then steeply increased by 95% to a peak of 100% in 120-180 s timescale. In other words,  
244 sand fragment was entirely crushed to silt-sized grains by 180 s of grinding. At silt-sized scale, breakage  
245 index slightly increased in 0-120 s timescale to just above 2%. It then sharply increased by 75% in 120-180  
246 s timescale, before flattening out in 180-240 s timescale. The index improved thereafter, decelerated,  
247 levelling off, and finally recovered in the subsequent timescales. At 720 s of grinding, index hit the course

248 high of 86%. The early sharp increase in breakage index (in 120-180 s timescale), agrees with the activation  
249 of surface imperfections and existing micro-fractures (see Fig. 2-3).

250 [Figure 2]

251 [Figure 3]

252 In Fig. 4, Signs of crystalline gradients were spotted on the original sand grains. These may either implicate  
253 a history of fracturing-healing through the post-solidification period, or conditions under which quartz  
254 crystalized. Irregular V-shaped pits on grain's surface are potential lines of weakness through which  
255 splitting occurred after 180 s of grinding.

256 [Figure 4]

257 According to the PSD curve shown in Fig. 5, the early breakage improved the degree of uniformity by  
258 eliminating the sand-size fragments. Jefferson et al. (1997) ascribed the early gap between the PSD curves  
259 to the "simple breakage of the original flawed sand grains". This agrees with observations made here in  
260 Fig 2.

261 [Figure 5]

262 Fig. 6 shows the progression of particle size distribution (PSD) curves with grinding time from 240 s to 720  
263 s. The phi-scale divisions are added to the grading plots to address the silt's sub-divisions easier. For an  
264 increase in grinding time from 240 seconds to 300 seconds, a positively skewed gap appeared between  
265 the PSD curves at 4-5  $\phi$ , which was then proceeded with a negatively skewed gap at 5-6  $\phi$ . These gaps  
266 represented crushing events in very coarse to coarse silts. Almost the entire volume of very coarse silts  
267 was crushed at the 240-300 s grinding timescale.

268 [Figure 6]

269 Further increase in grinding time from 300 s to 360 s produced very little breakage and therefore led to a  
270 negligible gap between PSD curves at 5-6  $\phi$ . Coarse silt grains were resistant against the impact energy,  
271 while crushing events in finer fragments continued at limited levels.

272 In the 600-720 seconds grinding timescale, the rate of breakdown surged at the 5-6  $\phi$  (coarse silts). The  
273 positively skewed gap between PSD curves suggested higher degrees of particle breakage in finer  
274 fragments.

275 A possible reason for lack of significant abrasion at 300-360 s timescale may be the mature state of  
276 material after 300 s of crushing. However, sets of fresh micro-fractures formed within the crystal of  
277 mature grains. Formation of fresh imperfections may probably a physical signature of fatigue fracturing  
278 under relatively moderate impact energies. The randomly selected grain at 300-360 s timescale (Fig. 7)  
279 shows signatures of fresh (sharp) parallel ridges on surfaces.

280 [Figure 7]

281 Higher degree of breakage in finer fragments at 240-300 s timescale (6-7  $\phi$ ) and at 600-720 s timescale  
282 reveals the tendency of sand-sized particles for continuous breakage.

283 The results presented above showed that size reduction in quartz is fractal phenomena, consisting of  
284 periods of breakage followed by periods of fatigue fracturing. Experiments also showed that both survived  
285 and broken grains continue to break and re-arrange along the period of impact energy application. A given  
286 impact energy level might not be sufficient enough to trigger breakage, but the prolonged application of  
287 the energy can potentially induce fresh surface imperfections along the internal crystalline defect planes.  
288 These highlights that neither sand nor silt is the end-product of abrasion at a given energy level. The  
289 experimental work also showed that high energy earth-surface processes such as the glacial abrasion  
290 generates significant amounts of silt-sized particles (Fig. 8 – early gap between the PSD curves at 5-7  $\phi$ ,

291 the pronounced mode size of loess, the main constituent of which is silt). However, further size reduction  
292 continues under less efficient input energies (i.e. the damping events, to be discussed in 4.3) but  
293 prolonged duration.

294 [Figure 8]

#### 295 *4.2 Fractal Dimension on Breakdown Timeline*

296 In Fig. 9, grinding time is plotted against  $K_{100}$  (i.e. maximum particle size). The plot shows fractal features,  
297 in which periods of stability are followed by periods of downturn trends. Declining trends however  
298 reduced in gradient with grinding time.

299 Largest particles survived within the first 120 s of grinding. Maximum diameter then plummeted at 180 s  
300 grinding time. Microscopic inspections suggested that this probably occurred due to the breakage of  
301 defected sand particles along lines of weakness (Fig. 2-4). The second period of resistance (little breakage)  
302 appeared at 180-240 s timescale before the second breakage event at 240-300 s timescale. This was then  
303 followed by the third period of resistance and the third breakage event.

304 [Figure 9]

305 At 120-180 s timescale, sand-sized scale breakage index hit 100% (Fig. 5), indicating the transition of entire  
306 sand-fraction into silt (Fig. 1) material. The significance of this transition appeared in the plummeted  
307 'maximum grain size' by 96.8% (Fig. 9 – in agreement with Blatt (1970)). Breakdown in larger grains was  
308 more pronounced than in finer grains (Fig. 8). Microscopic examinations revealed chevron-shaped cracks  
309 on the surface of randomly selected fine sand, after 120 s of grinding (Fig. 10 – in agreement with Smith  
310 et al. (1991) and also with Krinsley and Doornkamp (1973) images 55 and 56). As sand-fraction faded by  
311 an increase in grinding time to 180seconds, splitting possibly occurred by exploitation of existing micro-  
312 fractions (consistent with Cheng (2004)). The next grinding timescale (180-240 s) could be regarded as a

313 period of grains' resistance against the applying energy. This probably occurred due to the establishment  
314 of elevated number of contact points between grains (55  $\mu\text{m}$ ) and several edge-grounded finer particles  
315 (Fig. 8). The enhanced lateral confinement for grains allowed a better resistance against the applying  
316 energy. Further increase to the grinding time (to 300 s) however led to the breakdown of very coarse to  
317 coarse silt grains (4-6  $\phi$  – see Fig. 6) and the second major drop in the maximum grain size ( $K_{100}$ ) as shown  
318 in Fig. 9.  $K_{100}$  flattened out thereafter at 300-360 s, and then marginally fell at 360-600 s timescale. The  
319 sequences of decreasing-plateau trends revealed the fractal characteristics of  $K_{100}$ . Sequences also  
320 revealed the continuous breakage of large grain, although these grains survived splitting at certain  
321 previous grinding timescales due to the increasing number of lateral support from finer grains.

322 [Figure 9]

323 [Figure 10]

324 The step-wise particle breakage can be explained via the fractal dimension. This is drawn here from the  
325 power law exponent of Schumann distribution (Eq. 1).

$$326 \quad P = \left( \frac{S}{K_{100}} \right)^{n_s} \quad (\text{Eq. 1})$$

327 Where 'P' is the passing percent (by mass) through sieve size 'S'. The 'index of uniformity',  $n_s$ , can be  
328 demonstrated by the slope of PSD fitting line on a double logarithm plot of cumulative passing percentage  
329 versus normalized nominal diameter (i.e. diameter divided by  $K_{100}$ ). The fractal dimension is then derived  
330 from the index through Eq. 2 (Lu et al., 2003).

$$331 \quad D = 3 - n_s \quad (\text{Eq. 2})$$

332 Fig. 11a shows the double logarithm plot of cumulative passing percentage versus normalized particles'  
333 size. Graph shows an inverse relationship between Index of uniformity and grinding time. Fig. 10b shows  
334 the plot of fractal dimension against grinding time.

335 As shown in Fig. 11b, there was a steep rise in fractal dimension (i.e. poor sorting, well grading) in 0-180  
336 s timescale from 1.7 to a peak of 2.6. Fractal dimension then remained constant throughout the 180-720  
337 s timescale, with slight turbulence between 2.3 and 2.6. The plateau trend was probably due to the loss  
338 of energy efficiency through the grinding time. The declining trend of energy efficiency is due to the  
339 constant energy input through the experiment and the rising trend of fines population. As discussed  
340 earlier, fines provide lateral supports to relatively coarser grains and therefore damp the energy. Damping  
341 is also improves by the formation of platy crushed grains, and through enhanced degrees of lateral  
342 support to survived grains.

343 [Figure 11a]

344 [Figure 11b]

345 Fractal dimension was derived between 1.7 to 2.6, which generally conforms to the range of 2.2 to 2.6  
346 reported earlier in Lu et al. (2003) for same material. Fractal dimension was then formulated as a function  
347 of grinding time. An inverse of hyperbola function was used so to match the earlier work of (Lu et al.,  
348 2003) on the same test material (Eq. 3). Levenberg-Marquardt algorithm in non-linear regression was  
349 applied to derive the 'a' and 'b' coefficients. Regression resulted the 0.384 value for 'a' and '7.312' value  
350 for 'b' coefficients. The formulation then gave a theoretical maximum value of 2.51 for fractal dimension,  
351 as grinding time tending to infinity. 'From the quartz size-reduction perspective, the above results  
352 suggested that that sand and silt with defects are inherently breakable materials for fractal dimensions  
353 less than an intrinsic maximum.

354 
$$D = \frac{t}{at + b} \quad (Eq. 3)$$

355 *4.3 Mode-size Distribution on Breakdown Timeline*



356 The Leighton Buzzard sand possess an observed mode at around 100-400  $\mu\text{m}$  (Fig. 12-a) and a secondary  
357 pronounced mode at around 40-60  $\mu\text{m}$ . This corresponds well to the Quartz sand modal distribution in  
358 Assallay et al. (1998).

359 By the end of the initial grinding for 120 s, the original four mode sizes slightly shifted to left (Fig. 12-b).  
360 This gave rise to the population of grains at the silt-scale mode sizes (Fig. 12-b).

361 Further grinding to 180 s led to the disappearance of sand-scale mode size at the expense of an increased  
362 population of grains at silt-scale mode sizes (Fig. 12-c). An increase in the grinding time to 300 seconds  
363 faded the first pronounced silt-scale mode size (4-5  $\phi$  or 31 to 62  $\mu\text{m}$  – see Fig. 12-d). This can be viewed  
364 in conjunction with increasing breakage index at 240-300 s timescale (Fig. 1) and decreasing  $K_{100}$  at the  
365 same timescale (Fig. 9).

366 Results showed that all modes sizes at both sand- and silt-sized scales shifted or faded, except with the  
367 10-20  $\mu\text{m}$  mode size, which was preserved through the entire grinding time. The 10-20  $\mu\text{m}$  appeared as  
368 an intrinsic characteristic of the quartz, which was reproducible at varied grinding durations.

369 [Figure 12]

#### 370 *4.4 Energy Input on Breakdown Timeline*

371 The input energy was varied by putting a control on the mass of sand batch in mill's barrel. For ten 60 s  
372 long discontinuous grinding intervals, the barrel's feed mass was reduced by 30%. Increased input energy  
373 led to a poorly sorted silt output (Fig. 13a), maximal crushing of middle-sized grains and minimal crushing  
374 of relatively finer and coarser grains, and increase in population of 10-20  $\mu\text{m}$  and 3 $\nu\mu\text{m}$  sized grains (Fig.  
375 13b).

376 [Figure 13]

377 The maximum grain size ( $K_{100}$ ) changed only marginally with increasing energy input. This probably was  
378 due to the insufficient increase in prompted energy to break the 32  $\mu\text{m}$  silts, or due to the enhanced  
379 population of edge-grinded materials which in turn improved the confinement (or damping) around the  
380 32  $\mu\text{m}$  silt grains.

#### 381 *4.5 Discussion*

382 The sand-to-silt approach is granitic quartz is examined. To enable an objective assessment of  
383 micromechanics of size reduction, measurements of particle and mode size distribution, fractal indexes  
384 and micromorphological signatures were made. The crushing approach was probed through varied  
385 grinding time at a constant energy input, as well as varied energy input at constant grinding time. The  
386 close inspection of sorting, mode sizes, grains' population at mode sizes, fatigue stresses, and energy  
387 efficiency would suggest that:

388 1. The sand-to-silt size reduction pathway in Quartz possesses fractal properties (in sorting, maximum  
389 particle size, fractal dimension, and mode size distribution). Light transmission microscopy examination  
390 of sand- and silt-sized quartz samples before crushing revealed evidenced of surface imperfections and  
391 internal planes of varied taxonomy. As these were observed in grains after crushing, the surface and  
392 internal defects appears to be fractal features. This however slightly defers with the findings of Moss  
393 (1973) and Sharp and Gomez (1986). Therefore, the breakdown process explained here will also represent  
394 the size reduction mechanisms in coarser particles of debris at the base of glaciers.

395 2. Sand and silt are not final resistant products of the glacial comminution. Also, they are not the products  
396 of two mechanisms. These are in contrast with some earlier works (Rogers et al., 1963, Haldorsen, 1981,  
397 Wright, 1995), but in agreement with another line of works (Jefferson et al., 1997, Cheng, 2004, Kumar et  
398 al., 2006). This is because of the differences between crystallographically pure quartz and that with  
399 internal defects.

400 3. Results showed that there needs to be a prolonged application of moderate and declining energy (or  
401 alternatively application of a sudden but considerable energy) to crush a quartz fine sand or coarse silt to  
402 finer fragments. In other words, grain breakdown is not necessarily an energy-dependent process. Results  
403 also demonstrated that fatigue fracturing may occur either through prolonged stressing or transient  
404 stressing in a relatively shorter period. This agrees with the earlier works of Moss (1966) and Rabinowics  
405 (1976). This however argues the findings by Rittinger (1867) and Bond (1952) reported in Wright (1995).

406 4. Results showed an intrinsic pronounced mode size of 10-20 $\mu$ m in crushed material at varied grinding  
407 timescales. It is most probable that the internal crystalline defects have some control on the size of the  
408 silt output.

409 5. The sand-to-silt approach affects the relatively larger grains more than finer grains. Further crushing of  
410 the silt fragment via increased energy input re-distributed grains population evenly without changing the  
411 maximum grains size. The approach affects the middle-sized grains more than the relatively finer-sized  
412 and coarse-sized fragments.

## 413 **6. Conclusions**

414 Arithmetic fractal measures to account for quartz breakage, including fractal dimension, relative breakage  
415 index, maximum grain size, pronounced mode size and sorting were made to examine the size reduction  
416 timeline. The many geomorphic, climatic, and geologic controls on the silt formation were briefly  
417 reviewed. A group of works which questioned the quartz continuous breakdown within the sedimentary  
418 cycle was here spent more consideration. In short, the present work showed seven key results below.

419 Quartz breakdown is a fractal phenomenon. Sand and silt are not the products of two mechanism, even  
420 though certain controls brought the sand into the sedimentary system while other controls operated on  
421 sand to bring the silt into the sedimentary system. This is generally in agreement with the early idea of

422 Wentworth (1933). Whether the universal continental silt is more a product of glacial abrasion or  
423 sediment transport mechanism remains to be determined, but this research suggested that sand and silt  
424 are not final resistant products of abrasion. The current research also showed that the crystallographically  
425 defected sand and silt are inherently breakable materials for fractal dimensions less than an intrinsic  
426 maximum. Grain breakdown is not necessarily an energy-dependent process. Internal defects in quartz  
427 are independent from quartz size and the energy input. Experiments affirmed that a control exists which  
428 delivers significant contents of particles in the 10-20  $\mu\text{m}$  size. This control is independent from energy  
429 input, energy duration, and grains' starting size.

## 430 **7. References**

- 431 Abbireddy, C.O.R., Clayton, C.R.I., 2009. A review of modern particle sizing methods. Proc. Inst. Civil  
432 Eng.-Geotech. Eng. 162, 193-201.
- 433 Assallay, A.M., 1998. Structure and Hydrocollapse behaviour of loess. Loughborough University.
- 434 Assallay, A.M., Rogers, C.D.F., Smalley, I.J., 1996. Engineering properties of loess in Libya. Journal of Arid  
435 Environments 32, 373-386.
- 436 Assallay, A.M., Rogers, C.D.F., Smalley, I.J., Jefferson, I.F., 1998. Silt: 2-62  $\mu\text{m}$ , 9-4  $\phi$ . Earth-Science  
437 Reviews 45, 61-88.
- 438 Blatt, H., 1970. Determination of mean sediment thickness in the crust: a sedimentologic method.  
439 Geological Society of America Bulletin 81, 255-262.
- 440 Bolton, M.D., 1999. The role of micro-mechanics in soil mechanics, International workshop on soil  
441 crushability, Yamaguchi University, Japan.
- 442 Brown, G.J., Miles, N.J., Jones, T.F., 1996. A fractal description of the progeny of single impact single  
443 particle breakage. Minerals Engineering 9, 715-726.
- 444 BS 1377-2, 1990. Methods of test for Soils for civil engineering purposes: Part 2: Classification tests. BSi.
- 445 Cheng, Y.P., 2004. Micromechanical investigation of soil plasticity. Cambridge University.
- 446 Coop, M.R., Altuhafi, F.N., 2011. Changes to particle characteristics associated with the compression of  
447 sands. Geotechnique 61, 459-472.
- 448 Cooper, J., 1998. Particle size analysis - the Laser Diffraction technique. Material World 6 (1), 5-7.
- 449 Fuerstenau, M.C., Han, K. N., 2003. Principles of mineral processing. Society of Mining, Metallurgy, and  
450 Exploration, Inc., Colorado, USA.
- 451 Haldorsen, S., 1981. Grain-size distribution of subglacial till and its relation to glacial crushing and  
452 abrasion. Boreas 10, 91-105.
- 453 Hardin, B.O., 1985. Crushing of soil particles. Journal of Geotechnical Engineering, Proc. ASCE 111, 1177-  
454 1192.
- 455 Howarth, J.J., 2010. The shape of loess particles reviewed. Central European Journal of Geosciences 2(1),  
456 41-44.
- 457 Hyslip, J.P., Vallejo, L.E., 1997. Fractal analysis of the roughness and size distribution of granular  
458 materials. Eng. Geol. 48, 231-244.

459 Jefferson, I., Jefferson, B.Q., Assallay, A.M., Rogers, C.D.F., Smalley, I.J., 1997. Crushing of quartz sand to  
460 produce silt particles. *Naturwissenschaften* 84, 148-149.

461 Kumar, R., Jefferson, I.F., O'Hara-Dhand, K., Smalley, I.J., 2006. Controls on quartz silt formation by  
462 crystalline defects. *Naturwissenschaften* 93, 185-188.

463 Lu, P., Jefferson, I.F., Rosenbaum, M.S., Smalley, I.J., 2003. Fractal characteristics of loess formation:  
464 evidence from laboratory experiments. *Eng. Geol.* 69, 287-293.

465 Mandelbrot, B.B., 1983. *The fractal geometry of nature*. Freeman, New York.

466 Mitchell, J.K., Soga, K., 2005. *Fundamentals of soil behaviour*, 3rd edn. Wiley, New Jersey.

467 Moss, A.J., 1966. Origin, shaping and significance of quartz sand grains. *Journal of Geological Society of*  
468 *Australia* 13, 97-136.

469 Moss, A.J., 1973. Fatigue effects in quartz sand grains. *Sedimentary Geology* 10, 239-247.

470 O'Hara-Dhand, K., Assadi, A., Jefferson, I., Smalley, I., 2013, The Control of Loess Grain Shape in Size  
471 Distribution Data, In: Nield, J, & Wilson, R. (eds.) 19<sup>th</sup> Windy Day: UK aeolian research community  
472 meeting, University of Southampton.

473 Pecsí, M., 1990. Loess is not just accumulation of airbourne dust. *Quaternary International* 7/8, 1-21.

474 Posadas, A.N.D., Giménez, D., Bittelli, M., Vaz, C.M.P., Flury, M., 2001. Multifractal Characterization of  
475 Soil Particle-Size Distributions. *Soil Science Society of America Journal* 65, 1361-1367.

476 Pouclet, A., Horvath, E., Gabris, G., Juvigné, E., 1999. The Bag Tephra, a widespread tephrochronological  
477 marker in Middle Europe: chemical and mineralogical investigations. *Bulletin of Volcanology* 61, 265-  
478 272.

480 Pye, K., 1995. The nature, origin and accumulation of loess. *Quaternary Science Reviews* 14, 653-667.

481 Pye, K., Blott, S.J., 2004. Particle size analysis of sediments, soils and related particulate materials for  
482 forensic purposes using laser granulometry. *Forensic Sci.Int.* 144, 19-27.

483 Qiang, M.R., Chen, F.H., Wang, Z.T., Niu, G.M., Song, L., 2010. Aeolian deposits at the southeastern  
484 margin of the Tengger Desert (China): Implications for surface wind strength in the Asian dust source  
485 area over the past 20,000 years. *Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology Palaeoecology* 286, 66-80.

486 Rabinowicz, E., 1976. *Wear. Materials Science and Engineering* 25, 23-28.

487 Rogers, C.D.F., Smalley, I., 1993. The shape of loess particles. *Naturwissenschaften* 80, 461-462.

488 Rogers, J.J.W., Krueger, W.C., Krog, M., 1963. Sizes of naturally abraded materials. *Journal of*  
489 *Sedimentary Petrology* 33(3), 628-632.

490 Russell, R.J., 1944. Lower Mississippi valley loess. *Geological Society of America Bulletin* 55 (1), 1-40.

491 Santamarina, J.C., 2003. Soil behavior at the microscale: Particle forces, in: Germaine, J.T., Sheahan, T.C.,  
492 Whitman, R.V. (Eds.), *Soil Behavior and Soft Ground Construction*. Amer Soc Civil Engineers, New York,  
493 pp. 25-56.

494 Sharp, M., Gomez, B., 1986. Processes of debris comminution in the glacial environment and  
495 implications for quartz sand-grain micromorphology. *Sedimentary Geology* 46, 33-47.

496 Smalley, I., 1966. Formation of Quartz Sand. *Nature* 211, 476-479.

497 Smalley, I.J., Jefferson, I.F., Dijkstra, T.A., Derbyshire, E., 2001. Some major events in the development of  
498 the scientific study of loess. *Earth-Science Reviews* 54, 5-18.

499 Smalley, I.J., Jefferson, I.F., O'Hara-Dhand, K., Evans, R.D., 2006 a. An approach to the problem of loess  
500 deposit formation: Some comments on the 'in situ' or 'soil-eluvial' hypothesis. *Quaternary International*  
501 152, 109-117.

502 Smalley, I.J., Kumar, R., O'Hara-Dhand, K., Jefferson, I.F., Evans, R.D., 2005. The formation of silt material  
503 for terrestrial sediments: Particularly loess and dust. *Sedimentary Geology* 179, 321-328.

504 Smalley, I.J., Mavlyanova, N.G., Rakhmatullaev, K.L., Shermatov, M.S., Machalet, B., Dhand, K.O.,  
505 Jefferson, I.F., 2006 b. The formation of loess deposits in the Tashkent region and parts of Central Asia;  
506 and problems with irrigation, hydrocollapse and soil erosion. *Quaternary International* 152, 59-69.

507 Smith, B.J., Wright, J.S., Whalley, W.B., 1991. Simulated aeolian abrasion of Pannonian sands and its  
508 implications for the origins of Hungarian loess *Earth Surface Processes and Landforms* 16, 745-752.  
509 Smith, B.J., Wright, J.S., Whalley, W.B., 2002. Sources of non-glacial, loess-size quartz silt and the origins  
510 of "desert loess". *Earth-Science Reviews* 59, 1-26.  
511 Sorby, H.C., 1858. On the microscopical structure of crystals, indicating the origin of rocks and minerals.  
512 *Quarterly Journal of Geological Society, London* 14, 453-500.  
513 Turcotte, D.L., 1986. Fractals and fragmentation. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth* 91, 1921-  
514 1926.  
515 Wang, D., Fu, B., Zhao, W., Hu, H., Wang, Y., 2008. Multifractal characteristics of soil particle size  
516 distribution under different land-use types on the Loess Plateau, China. *CATENA* 72, 29-36.  
517 Wentworth, C. K., 1933. Fundamental limits of the sizes of classic grains. *Science* 77, 633-634.  
518 Wright, J., Smith, B., 1993. Fluvial comminution and the production of loess-sized quartz silt - a  
519 simulation study. *Geografiska Annaler Series a-Physical Geography* 75, 25-34.  
520 Wright, J., Smith, B., Whalley, B., 1998. Mechanisms of loess-sized quartz silt production and their  
521 relative effectiveness: laboratory simulations. *Geomorphology* 23, 15-34.  
522 Wright, J.S., 1995. Glacial comminution of quartz sand grains and the production of loessic silt: A  
523 simulation study. *Quaternary Science Reviews* 14, 669-680.  
524 Zourmpakis, A., Boardman, D.I., Rogers, C.D.F., 2003. Creation of artificial loess soils, Proceeding of  
525 International Conference From Experimental Evidence towards Numerical Modelling of Unsaturated  
526 Soils, Weimar, Germany

527

## 528 **Figure Captions**

529 Fig 1 The Hardin's relative breakage index (i.e. how far the grains are crushed in the scale of 0 to 1) against  
530 grinding time for silt-sized and sand-sized grains

531 Fig 2 Petrological microscopy image of a silt grain with surficial evidence of a fracture: a possible un-  
532 opened healed micro-crack

533 Fig 3 Transmission light microscopy image of a sub-angular platy crushed quartz grain with surficial  
534 evidence of an internally crystalline defect plane: an inclined cleavage plane inside the grain

535 Fig 4 Crystalline gradients and surface imperfections under transmitted light for randomly selected silt  
536 before grinding

537 Fig 5 Particle size distribution curves of original sand material as well as ground materials (i.e. crushed for  
538 120s to 720 s)

539 Fig 6 Particle size distribution curves of ground quartz material: crushed for 240 s, 300 s, 360 s, and 720 s

540 Fig 7 Sharp parallel ridges on a fine silt's surface, indicating the possible fresh imperfections at the 300-  
541 360 s grinding timescale

542 Fig 8 Particle size distribution curves of ground quartz material: the significance of size reduction as  
543 grinding time increased from 120 s to 240 s

544 Fig 9 (upper) The significance of the drop in maximum particle size ( $K_{100}$ ) with an increase in the grinding  
545 time from 120 s to 240 s (Lower) The fractal pattern of decreasing  $K_{100}$  with the impact energy input.

546 Fig 10 Chevron-shaped cracks on fine sand (120 s grinding)

547 Fig 11a The inverse relationship between the index of uniformity (i.e. slope of the PSD curve) and grinding  
548 time

549 Fig 11b The sharp change in the fractal dimension through the early (i.e. under relatively low energy input)  
550 sand-to-silt transition and the significance of loss of impact energy efficiency due to the soared population  
551 of crushed fine particles.

552 Fig 12 Mode size distribution curve of the original and grinded materials (a) primary pronounced modes  
553 in the original sand (b) initial grinding and change in the population of the grains of pronounced mode  
554 sizes (c) the fully sand-to-silt transition after an increase in grinding time (d) the crushing of coarse silt into  
555 fine silt after a further increase in grinding time

556 Fig 13 loss in middle-sized silt grains and survival of fine and coarse sized silt grains upon an increase in  
557 the impact energy

558