

EXAMINING THE IMPACT OF TRUST ON BANK-CUSTOMER RELATIONSHIP MANAGEMENT: EVIDENCE FROM NIGERIA.

**Kareem Folohunso Sani
Ayantunji Gbadamosi
Rula Al-Abdulrazak**
University of East London, UK

This research investigates the impact of 'Trust' on bank-customer relationship management in the Nigerian banking industry, and its roles on their performances over the years. The study is interpretive in nature and involves the conduct of thirteen (13) in-depth interviews on the subject-matter, with banks' customers in Gombe, Nigeria. It shows that a relationship does exist between Trust, Relationship Marketing and Banks' Performance indicators. The study also found that trust will change in terms of its influence and effects over the lifecycle of relationship development. It identifies various aspects of trust in banking and they include: Trust in bank's liquidity position, promise fulfilments, communication systems, staffs, service delivery processes, online systems and physical and cyber security apparatus. These could serve as useful tools for decision making in the banking system. This paper has contributed to the relationship marketing literature by ascertaining the positive role of trust in relationship building and the resultant positive impacts on customer's retention and bank's profitability. Various aspects of bank's trust were also identified for the first time.

Keywords: Trust, Relationship Marketing, Banking Industry, Nigeria.

INTRODUCTION

The construct of trust has been of interest to various scholars all over the world and has been extensively researched across various disciplines including economics, sociology, political science, information technology and psychology. Over the years, trust has also been theorized in the field of marketing and in various sub-fields such as consumer marketing, retail marketing, industrial marketing and service marketing. This has led to the development of a new sub-field called relationship marketing. In relationship marketing literature, various researchers (see for example, Sheth, 2017; Hollebeek and Macky, 2019) have shown that trust facilitates customer retention and loyalty. It is therefore seen as a very important variable in human interactions. However; there are few extensive empirical studies regarding trust in the marketing discipline from the banking context (see for example, Sun et al., 2017). Thus; the emergence of this study is necessitated in realization of the fact that limited research has been carried out to identify the contributions of trust in relationship building between customers and banks. Hence this study provides an integrative view of trust and relationship development in the context of banking industry.

THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

Trust Overview

Trust has been viewed as one of the major variables that foster firm-customer relationship quality and customer satisfaction (Hollebeek and Macky, 2019). Fatima et al. (2018) also identified 'trust' as a means of relationship building and winning customer loyalty in any service

industry. Ndubisi & Capel (2011) conclude that it is likely to improve customer's confidence in an organisation, and the resultant customer loyalty. A betrayal of this trust by banks can lead to customers' dissatisfaction with resultant negative effect on relationship management. To achieve this, Gronroos (1990) suggests that the resources of an organization should be channelled towards maintaining and strengthening customer's trust. It is therefore seen as critical for banks' survival in today's competitive environment. However; its impact on bank-customer relationship management has not been given much attention in the literature.

Conceptualization and Dimensions of Trust

The concept of trust in customer-business relationship plays a major role in today's business world that is characterized by risk and uncertainty (Fatima et al., 2018). It is synonymous with trustworthiness, confidence, faith and even loyalty. Svare et al. (2019) defined trust as "a generalised expectancy held by an individual that the word, promise, oral or written statement of a person or group can be relied upon". It has been a major topic of interest among various disciplines. Recent strands of literature provided an in-depth understanding of the concept and its role in relationship marketing (Dowell et al., 2015; Fatima et al., 2018; Hollebeek and Macky, 2019). In banking, Ahmed et al. (2019) defined trust as the customer trust in banking services, based on prior banking experience, bank's reliability and positive corporate image. This paper considers Ahmed et al. (2019) definition as it relates to the banking industry, which is the focus of the research. Customers expect their banks to perform banking functions in accordance with their contractual agreements. However, [Roy et al. \(2011\)](#) argue that the issue of trust is not as simple as it is usually presented by scholars, it is far more complex; with various dimensions. As a result, it has been viewed along varying dimensions in different disciplines. For example, the personality psychologists see it as an individual characteristic, while social psychologists see it from the perspective of behavioral expectations of others involved in transactions. Brattström et al. (2019) argue in favour of integrating the divergent views of trust development across various disciplines, to provide a deeper understanding of the concept at both the individual and institutional level. This paper explored trust dimensions from two different perspectives: The macro versus micro-level trust and cognitive versus affective elements of trust.

The Macro and Micro-Level Trust

One of the classifications of trust is suggested by Bachmann and Inkpen (2011) who used level of occurrence to classify it into micro and macro-level trust. 'Micro level' trust is a relational-based trust, which develops through personal experience between two or more people. While 'macro-level' trust is an institutional-based trust, which advocates that trust can be established between two parties due to institutional integrity; without any prior relational experience (Bachmann and Inkpen, 2011). Institutional-based trust can be of a formal nature such as laws or certifications, as well as informal; including corporate reputation or community norms (Bachmann and Inkpen, 2011). Therefore, at the macro level; the "institutional environment in which interactions are entrenched are viewed as constitutive elements in trust development".

The Cognitive and Affective Elements of Trust

The Cognitive Elements of Trust

The cognitive and affective elements of trust is another type of trust suggested in the literature (Punyatoya, 2019). Cognitive elements are of three types: Integrity trust, competency trust, and Goodwill or benevolence trust (Young and Albaum, 2002). 'Integrity element of cognitive trust is defined by Young and Albaum (2002) as an act of keeping and fulfilling promises, based upon the moral norm of honesty. Thus, 'integrity trust' can be said to be contractual trust, commitment trust and promise trust. The second element of cognitive trust is 'competency trust', which is also known as ability trust and expertise trust (Punyatoya, 2019). Punyatoya, (2019) described it as the extent to which one party believes that its exchange partner has the required professional expertise, relevant skills, qualifications and experience to effectively perform the job. The third cognitive element of trust is 'goodwill or benevolence trust'. Punyatoya (2019) defined it as the extent of believes in a person or organization that an interest

will be adequately protected without a formal request. It is based on a rational assessment and knowledge of the other party, based on experiences from past behaviours.

The Affective Elements of Trust

Affective' based trust involves emotional bonds and social skills associated with care and concern for the other party (Yang et al., 2019). Massey & Dawes (2007) proposed two elements for affective trust, namely: 'Relational' and 'Intuitive'. Relational trust is an aspect of affective trust which is associated with the norm of reciprocation and has to do with faith in the other party (Yang et al., 2019). It is almost like a religious belief, with faith placed on the other partner that they will act as they should, in a trustworthy manner. It is a non-rational assessment of trustworthiness based on the norm of reciprocation and not on knowledge or an actual assessment of past behaviours, while 'intuitive trust' relates to biased judgments based on moods and feelings about another person's character.

Trust and Relationship Development

'Trust' is seen as an antecedent which influences relationship development. However; Ganesan (1994) argues that a stable relationship can influence trust as well. Hollebeek and Macky (2019) observed that trust helps partners to build confidence in a relationship from the initial period over a very long period. Some have even argued that it is even the key construct in the process of relationship evolution (for example, Hollebeek and Macky, 2019). Thus, Fatima et al. (2018) concluded that "a customer that is dependent on a trusted firm may establish a long-term relationship with the firm. There are also some consensus in the literature (Dowell et al., 2015), which agree that trust will change in terms of its influence and effects over the lifecycle of relationship development. Therefore, at the beginning of business relationship development, Hansen et al. (2013) declared that buyer-seller relationship initiation is important and should be based on mutual trust, for long-term relationship development. Therefore, understanding what to be done at early stage of relationship development and how it changes as the relationship matures is of importance to the continuous customer retention, as marketers adapt various relationship marketing strategies to meet the changing relationship life cycle in any organisation. Therefore, the concept of relationship marketing is more than just getting the customers, but it also includes maintaining the existing customers for long-term business relationships. According to social exchange theory as theorized by Ganesan (1994), the development of a relationship is like a marriage relationship, and a stable relationship is directly associated with the development of trust. Narteh and Nana (2011) asserted that in a credence-based industry like banking system, trust is an important factor shaping customer-bank relationships. Thus; the quality of trust between bank's customers and the frontline tellers, customer care officers, account officers, relationship officers and the role of relationship managers, all have impacts on relationship development. Meanwhile, Blomqvist (1997) argued that customers' decision to build relationship with a business organisation is not necessarily a positive sign of trust. It might be due to lack of any alternative for the customer to choose from. While the central role of trust in relationship building has often been noted in the marketing literature, it remains to be established whether the findings of Morgan and Hunt (1994) concerning the mediating role of trust are generalisable across the research stream.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The chosen methodology for this research is qualitative. This is considered most suitable for extensive data collection, to understand the various aspects of trust and its impacts on relationship marketing. This is because it allows the researchers to generate more data beyond the initial planned interview questions, as there is emerging information from the respondents during the interviews.

Participants and procedure

Specifically, a phenomenological research approach is employed in the study to provide insights into the various aspects of trust and their impacts on relationship marketing in banking. This paradigm adopted involves understanding human behavior from the participant's own frame of

reference (Cronin, 2017). Although some studies are amenable to the use of positivism research paradigm which emphasizes scientific approaches for research, a critical analysis of the highlighted aims and objectives of this study suggests that the research propensity is towards the phenomenological tradition and logically, the research strategy should therefore be qualitative. Considering the nature of banking industry and bank customers in Nigeria, this adopted research philosophy was considered most appropriate to achieve the set goal. Since the goal of this research was to identify the role of trust on relationship marketing, participants from various categories of bank customers were recruited. All the respondents were recruited through personal contacts (i.e., convenience sample) and by the snowball sampling method (Miles et al., 2013). The recruitment was voluntary, and thirteen respondents eventually participated in the exercise. These participants comprise eight men (age between 18 and 58), and five women (age between 19 and 51), to represent various segments of the bank customers.

Data Collection Procedure

Evidence in the literature suggests that method of generating data qualitatively are enormous (See for example, Bell et al., 2019), but semi-structured interview method was adopted for this study as endorsed by many researchers including Aguinis and Bradley (2014). This is considered more useful to generate more insightful data that would help in achieving the overall aims and objectives of this study. Thirteen open-ended semi-structured interviews were conducted and analysed. The interviews were conducted face-to-face and individually at various venues and times of the day, at the convenience of the respondents. Most of the interviews lasted approximately for about between 30 to 45 minutes. Substantial length of time was spent to understand the individuality of the respondents during this inquiry (prolonged engagement). At the end, thirteen (13) individual interviews were deemed appropriate for this study, as this was the stage where theoretical saturation was achieved. This is a stage where no new idea was produced through the inclusion of another interview (Corbin and Strauss, 2013). The data collection was conducted for a period of 4 months and took place in Gombe which is in the north eastern part of Nigeria. As suggested by Thomas and Magilvy (2011), direct quotations and individual reflective statements of the interviewees were used to strengthen the credibility of the study.

PRESENTING THE EMPIRICAL FINDINGS

Trust is identified as the pillar upon which the relationship management of any business is built. The impacts of trust on relationship marketing cannot be over-emphasized. Trust is thus seen as a key factor in bank-customer relationship development. Accordingly, this study has identified various aspects of trust the banking industry. These include: Trust in bank liquidity position, trust in bank's promise fulfilments, trust in bank communication systems, trust in bank's staffs, trust in bank's service delivery processes, trust in bank's online transactions and trust in bank's physical and cyber security systems. These are presented below:

Trust in Bank's Liquidity Position

Bank's liquidity is the bank's financial position of the bank, which shows the capability to continually provide financial services to the customers. Trust in a bank liquidity has been a major consideration in bank-customer relationship development. Nigerian customers have over the years witnessed series of banks' collapses that had led to loss of money saved in many of the failed banks. The cash reserves requirements as licenced by the Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN) is categorised into national and regional banking operations. National banking licence permit a bank to operate its banking operations throughout the country. On the contrary, regional banks are lesser banks that operate at a regional capacity. The minimum requirement to obtain national banking licence is One Hundred billion (N100 billion) Naira (\$328M), while banks that cannot afford the financial requirement for national licence can apply for regional banking licence; which is Twenty-Five billion (N25 billion) Naira (\$82M). The study found that Nigerian customers do not trust banks that are operating at regional level due to prior negative experiences in bank failure. Therefore, it was established in the study that national

licenced banks are more trusted for long-term relationship engagement than regional banks. So, customers have more confidence and trust in the safe keep of their financial fortune in national banks than regional banks. Customers' perception is that banks that operate under the regional scheme are weak and prone to liquidity challenges that may negatively affect their operations. So, bank's reserve requirement as prescribed by the central bank of Nigeria (CBN), provides a clue on financial viability of a bank to the customers. Some of the participants have these to say:

"I was once a victim of a failed bank during which I lost my life savings, so, I follow the daily financial news; to monitor the trends in the industry and my banks' financial positions".

"I prefer to bank with National licenced banks with stronger financial positions, than regional banks that are prone to liquidity challenges"

Trust in Bank's Promise Fulfilments

Trust in bank's promise fulfilment is another area of trust that was discovered during the empirical part of this study. At the beginning of any contractual relationship, every bank has service level agreement that they always promise to deliver to the customers. Unfortunately, banks are often faced with so many internal and external challenges that may prevent them from fulfilling their agreed service level promises to the customers. The internal challenges could be wrong management decisions, inadequate planning for contingencies, dishonesty on the part of the bank management, staff attitude, designing unattainable promises to win customers' patronage and so on. The external challenges could be economic situation, government policies, regulatory requirements and frequent customers' changing needs. The findings indicate that banks that always fulfil their service promises will earn customers' trust than banks that constantly fail to fulfil their promises. So, when a bank is trusted for promise fulfilments, the customers will be willing to maintain long-term relationship with such a bank. The reverse is the case, when a bank is known for breaking promises; with the resultant negative effects on relationship marketing. The following is a quote from another respondents:

"I was misled into opening a salary account with my current bank with loan promises, but after opening and moving my salary to the bank, the story changed".

"I had an encounter with a bank's marketing team with lots of financial services promises, but the moment of truth came when most of the promises could not be fulfilled after opening a business account with the bank".

Trust in Bank's Communication Systems

In today's 21st century digital world, banks are open to so many medium of communication to reach their customers. Banks can reach their customers through varieties of electronic media like Facebook, twitter, Instagram, WhatsApp, LinkedIn, email, text messages, and phone calls. Using these mediums to communicate financial service issues and marketing to the customers depends largely on the staffs and banks' capabilities and such usage varies from bank to bank. The study found that bank's ability to use any of these mediums to market their products and accurately communicate service offerings to the customers, positively influence customers' trust in the bank. This helps banks to develop long lasting relationship with the customers. Therefore, banks that are trying to build long lasting relationship with their customers, will always endeavour to establish a reliable communication system between the banks and their customers. This is essential to facilitate understanding, cordiality and mutual agreement that would support relationship marketing goal of the bank. For example, communicating changes in bank charges to the customers before its implementation, will boost customer's trust in the bank. The use of sms alerts to communicate banks' transactions on their requests also builds trust. Thus, when a customer's account is debited or credited for a specified sum of money, a sms alert is sent to the customer, confirming that the transaction has been successfully consummated. This type of real time communication between banks and their customers strengthen bank-customer relationships, as differences in the service agreement are easily sorted and resolved amicably.

“My trust in my bank has been eroded over the years because; new charges are usually introduced without prior notice or communication”.

I subscribed for a sms alert on every of my transaction with the bank, unfortunately, I hardly get them. I had to either check online or go to the nearest branch to confirm if the transaction(s) were successful.

Trust in Bank's Staffs

Bank staffs play a major role in bank-customer relationship marketing management. The study found that banks' staff attitudes and commitments toward the customers, their skills and service delivery mechanisms, as well as their interactions with the customers, all have impacts on customer's trust in the banks' financial service delivery. So, trust in bank's staff ability to deliver the expected financial services positively influence relationship development. Thus, staff with high interaction skills and good attitude towards the customers are more likely to win customers' trust than those with low interaction skills and bad attitude towards the customers. Banks' staff commitment towards delivering financial services also play a fundamental role in trust developments. When banks' staffs are committed, they tend to show empathy and go extra mile to satisfy the customers, which enhances long-term relationship development. Therefore, bank's staff skills, attitudes, commitments and interactions with the customers should be constantly monitored by bank management executives. This is to ensure that the right skills and the right attitudes are constantly presented by committed banks' staffs, during their interactions and delivery of financial services to the customer.

“My bank's staffs are not helpful and polite; they don't even respect their customers.”

“Some bank's staffs do not have enough knowledge about the bank's products, they will ask you to wait for several minutes, while they ask their superiors for answers to your questions”.

Trust in Bank's Service Delivery Processes

Bank's service delivery processes also influence customer-bank trust and relationship development. The study found that banks whose service delivery processes are simpler and easier are more likely to win customers' trust and retain them for a very long time, than banks with cumbersome processes. The reason is that customers want the delivery of financial services to be quick, secured and accurate. The study found that traditional banking system in Nigeria is though accurate and secured but very slow. Many of the participants express their frustrations at the constant long hours stay on the queue in the banking hall, either for cash deposits or withdrawals; and other banking services like fund transfer requests, account opening, account balance enquiries and so on. For example, although some customers (especially the educated) have subscribed to electronic banking system, to enhance speedy transactions. Unfortunately, Nigeria economy is a cash-driven economy, where customers prefer mostly cash transactions. More so, it takes days or even weeks for most banks to open a bank account for a prospective customer. Lastly, the role of internal control mechanisms put in place by the banks to check frauds is also slowing down the processes. To resolve these challenges, banks should endeavour to provide more staffs, with more infrastructural facilities; with simpler processing mechanisms to deliver services that are quick, accurate and secured to the customers. This will help eradicate long stay in the banking hall, with the resultant positive effects on customers' trust and relationship development. Below are some of the quotes from the respondents during the interviews:

“I get discouraged from using my bank and I am thinking of switching, because of the long waiting time for a service. I had to wait for several minutes (almost an hour) on a long queue in the banking hall for cash deposits”.

“The process of opening an account is too cumbersome, it takes almost three days to get my account opened; due to various bottlenecks involved in account opening. That almost put me off, I was frustrated”.

Trust in Bank's Online Transactions

The introduction of modern innovative technology has introduced a new way into how banks provide financial services to the customers. Thus, the study found that how banks' online transactions are being consummated, significantly influence relationship marketing. The study indicates that customers are willing to engage in self-service financial transactions online, if the bank's online platform is secure, reliable, easier, faster and more convenient. Therefore, customer's trust in the sophistication of bank's online banking application platform for the conduct of their financial transactions; positively influence relationship development. Thus, the quality of internet banking, mobile banking, Point of Sale (POS) and automated teller machine (ATM) transactions all have impacts on trust. For example, Nigeria economy is cash based, with banks experiencing large volume of cash withdrawals on their ATMs. Unfortunately, many banks often run out of cash and find it difficult to satisfy customers' ATM cash withdrawals. This is often seen as service failure which over time erodes trust and may hamper bank's relationship marketing goal. Thus, banks that are providing uninterrupted 24/7 ATM services with minimised cash jam during ATM cash withdrawals are likely to win customer trust that would keep them for a long time with the bank.

"I do most of my banking transactions online and the experience has been wonderful"

"One thing I like about my bank that is keeping me, is their seamless online financial services delivery processes, including 24/7 uninterrupted ATM transactions".

Trust in Bank's Physical and Cyber Security

Cyber security is a major concern for many online users around the globe. In banking, customers are more concerned with the security of their banking activities online; to avoid loss of funds. This feeling of cyber threats is creating mistrust and most customers avoid using banks' online application platforms (electronic banking) for their financial transactions. This has been the major cause of fewer interest in the use of electronic banking in Nigeria. However, the findings revealed that some customers (especially the educated customers) are now using the electronic banking platforms like the Internet and Mobile banking. The findings show that customers will always verify the potency of their banks' cyber security measures, before engaging in contractual online banking relationships. Accordingly, banks with the most formidable stronger security measures in place are more likely to win customers' trust than banks with weak security measures. This is because customers will not be willing to risk their monies and life savings while transacting on an unsecured online bank application platform. Apart from the online security measures, the study also found that the physical security measures in place is also important to the customer. Bank robbery is a menace in Nigeria and the findings suggested that the security of customers' monies influences their trust and relationship development. Although banks bear the responsibilities for armed robbers' attacks, fire outbreak, stealing by staff among others, but customers still prefer to patronize banks with adequate security measures in place. It is therefore imperative for banks to always provide adequate physical and cyber security measures to protect lives and properties within and around the bank premises, to enhance customers' trust and lasting relationship development. The following quotes from some of the respondents buttress the point:

"I am scared of using my bank's online platform for security reasons, the reason is that I have seen friends and close associates who are victims of cybercrimes".

"I am a businessman who is always carrying cash around. So, I prefer patronizing banks that allow customers to drive in their cars to the bank premises, and with adequate security measures in place. The reason is that most times, customers are being robbed in front of the bank while parking their cars outside the bank premises".

DISCUSSION

This paper examined the influence of trust on relationship marketing in banking, to develop a better understanding on how business-to-business and business to customer relationships evolve. A key contribution of this paper is that it has been able to identify various aspects of trust in banking. Further findings reveal that customers patronize banks of their choices based on the trust and confidence that such banks will always satisfy their needs (van Esterik-Plasmeijer and van Raaij, 2017). Kimpakorn and Tocquer (2009) also argued that trust alone cannot win customer loyalty; it must include customer satisfaction. This equally agrees with the research findings, as it was discovered that the most trusted and reliable bank in Nigeria (First Bank Nigeria Plc), as widely proclaimed by all the participants, still loses its dissatisfied customers to the competitors. Bank's management executives in Nigeria must therefore build trust to align with customer satisfaction, to ensure the success of relationship management in the industry. Unfortunately; lack of trust is found by this study to be prevalent among bank customers in Nigeria, making them to engage in multiple banking behaviours, by patronizing two or more banks to meet their banking needs. The following extracts illustrates their common observations:

“I am operating two bank accounts in two different banks to avoid disappointments as banks do not always deliver on their corporate promises”

One can see as demonstrated above that customers clearly give priority to trust in their dealings with banks. To create trust, government fight against corruption should be vigorously pursued to stop or reduce insider abuse of the system. Customers (depositors) must also be assured of the safety of their money. This will help to improve trust in the banks and the society at large. Constant change in policies should also be avoided to minimise bad publicity that would create fear and mistrust in the mind of the banking public. Policies that will strengthen the banking industry against incessant liquidation and persistent merger and acquisitions witnessed in recent years should be entrenched, to create a long-lasting trust between the banks and their customers. This is important as the institutional environment in which banks and customers interactions are entrenched is viewed as constitutive elements in trust development. Furthermore, the study equally found employee motivation as essential tools for building trust in the minds of bank customers in Nigeria. It is believed that happy employee leads to happy customer, which in turn leads to happy bank. Furthermore, keeping to their corporate promises and avoid misleading advertisements to lure customers, will lead to favourable corporate image; leading to trust and relationship development. Just as a participant put it:

“Nigeria banks often deceive prospective customers in their adverts, by over promising to deliver excellent services to the customers”.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE STUDY

The implications of the study are enormous. First, bank executive management should seize the interactive opportunities with customers, to build trust in the minds of their target customers; for long-term relationship benefits. To achieve this; managers need to understand the strength of their staff and use this to build customer's trust. Honesty and delivering on corporate promises on the part of the bank management are also important. This can help establish trust at the early stage of relationship development. Marketing executives and scholars alike are also encouraged to ensure that the various aspects of trust identified in this study: Bank's liquidity position, bank's promise fulfilments, bank's communication systems, behaviour of bank's staffs, bank's delivery processes, bank's online systems and bank's physical and cyber security apparatus, are considered for improving their banking services delivery. This will help banks to have competitive advantage and keep profitable customers for a long time.

LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STUDIES

There are several limitations of this study. The first limitation is the conduct of the research in Gombe, north eastern part of Nigeria. Therefore, the study is not a reflection of happenings in the entire Africa and other developing countries. Future studies should expand to other Africa countries, to ascertain the actual happenings in other parts of Africa. Also; the findings from this study are based on information and data collected from the participants during in-depth interviews and focus group discussion, and as such; could be biased and may not reflect the actual happenings in the banking industry in Nigeria. Finally, the research was restricted to banking industry, without separately analyzing the results for business relationships in other industries. So, it is possible that different results may be produced; by focusing solely on specific industries or relationship types. Further research should therefore extend the studies to areas different from banking, to provide a more profound view of happenings in other industries.

CONCLUSION

The purpose of this research is to establish a more complete conceptualization of trust impact on relationship development in Africa, using Nigerian banking industry as a contextual platform. Findings have revealed that trust plays a major role in relationship development and the resultant effects on organization's performance. The study identified various aspects of trust which should be taken into cognizance, when designing relationship marketing in banking. These include: Trust in bank liquidity position, trust in bank's promise fulfilments, trust in bank's communication systems, trust in bank's staffs, Trust in bank's service delivery processes, trust in bank's online transactions and trust in bank's physical and cyber security systems. It is an established fact that every customer wants to maintain a long-term contractual relationship with a bank that is financially stable, fulfil corporate promises, communicate effectively, delivers high quality service both traditionally and online, and with skilled committed staff. Banks are therefore advised to apply these findings to win and retain customers for a very long period.

REFERENCES

- Aguinis H., and Bradley, K.J. (2014). Best Practice Recommendations for Designing and Implementing Experimental Vignette Methodology Studies. *Organizational Research Methods*, Vol. 7, No. 4, pp. 351–371. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1094428114547952>.
- Ahmed, S et al. (2019). A Study on Trust Restoration Efforts in the UK Retail Banking Industry, *The British Accounting Review*, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bar.2019.100871>
- Aurier, P., & N'Goala, G. (2010). The Differing and Mediating Roles of Trust and Relationship Commitment in Service Relationship Maintenance and Development. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol. 38, No. 3, Pp. 303–325.
- Awasthi, P. and Sangle, P.S. (2012). "Adoption of CRM Technology in Multichannel Environment: A Review (2006-2010)". *Business Process Management Journal*, Vol. 18, No. 3, Pp. 445 – 471.
- Bachmann, R., Inkpen, A.C., (2011). Understanding Institutional-based Trust Building Processes in Inter-organizational Relationships. *Organisational Studies*, Vol. 32, No. 2, Pp. 281–301.
- Bell, E., Bryman, A., Harley, B., & Bryman, A. (2019). *Business research methods*. Oxford, Oxford University Press.
- Blomqvist, K. (1997). The Many Faces of Trust. *Scandensavia Journal of Management*, Vol. 13, Pp. 271–286.

- Brattström, A., Faems, D. and Mähring, M. (2019). From Trust Convergence to Trust Divergence: Trust Development in Conflictual Interorganizational Relationships. *Organization Studies*, Vol. 40, No. 11, pp.1685-1711.
- Corbin, J. M., & Strauss, A. L. (2013). *Basics of Qualitative Research: Techniques and Procedures for Developing Grounded Theory*.
- Cronin, B. (2017). *Phenomenology of Human Understanding*. Eugene, Wipf and Stock Publishers. <http://public.eblib.com/choice/publicfullrecord.aspx?p=4901737>.
- Dowell, D., Mark, M., Heffernan, T. (2015). The Changing Importance of Affective Trust and Cognitive Trust Across the Relationship Lifecycle: A Study of Business-to-Business Relationships. *Industrial Marketing Management* Vol. 44, Pp. 119–130.
- Fatima, J.K. and Di Mascio, R. (2018). Reversing the Dependency-Trust Relationship in B2C Services. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, Vol. 41, pp.1-10.
- Ganesan, S. (1994). Determinants of Long-term Orientation in Buyer–seller Relationships. *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 58, No. 1, Pp. 1–19.
- Gronroos, C. (1990). “Relationship Approach to the Marketing Function in Service Contexts: The Marketing and Organizational Behaviour Interface”. *Journal of Business Research*, Vol. 20, No. 1, Pp. 3-12.
- Hansen, J. D., Beitelspacher, L. S., & Deitz, G. D. (2013). Antecedents and Consequences of Consumers' Comparative Value Assessments Across the Relationship Life Cycle. *Journal of Business Research*, Vol. 66, No. 4, Pp. 473–479.
- Hollebeek, L.D. and Macky, K. (2019). Digital Content Marketing's Role in Fostering Consumer Engagement, Trust, and Value: Framework, Fundamental Propositions, and Implications. *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, Vol. 45, pp. 27-41.
- Kimpakorn, N. and Tocquer, G. (2009). "Employees' Commitment to Brands in the Service Sector: Luxury Hotel Chains in Thailand", *Journal of Brand Management*, Vol. 16, No. 8, Pp. 532-544.
- Massey, G. R., & Kyriazis, E. (2007). Interpersonal Trust Between Marketing and R&D During New Product Development Projects. *European Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 41, No. 9/10, Pp. 1146–1172.
- Morgan, R. M., & Hunt, S. D. (1994). The Commitment–Trust Theory of Relationship Marketing. *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 58, No. 3, Pp. 20–38.
- Narteh, B. & Nana O. (2011). An Analysis of Students' Knowledge and Choice Criteria in Retail Bank Selection in Sub-Saharan Africa. *International Journal of Bank Marketing* Vol. 29, No. 5, Pp. 373-397.
- Ndubisi, N. & Capel, M. (2011). Examining the Inter-relationships Among the Dimensions of Relationship Marketing. *Asian Journal of Business Research*, Vol. 1, No. 1, Pp. 18-36.
- Punyatoya, P. (2019). Effects of Cognitive and Affective Trust on Online Customer Behaviour. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, Vol. 37, No. 1, pp. 80-96.
- Roy, S.K. Eshghi, A. and Shekhar V. (2011). Dimensions of Trust and Trustworthiness in Retail Banking: Evidence from India. *Marketing Management Journal*, Vol. 21, pp. 97-110.
- Schmidt, E. (2015). Modest Non-conceptualism: Epistemology, Phenomenology, and Content. <https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&scope=site&db=nlebk&db=nlabk&AN=1023001>.
- Sheth, J. (2017). Revitalizing Relationship Marketing. *Journal of Services Marketing*, Vol. 31, No. 1, pp. 6-10.

- Svare, H., Gausdal, A.H. and Möllering, G. (2019). The Function of Ability, Benevolence, and Integrity-based Trust in Innovation Networks. *Industry and Innovation*, pp. 1-20.
- Thomas, E. Magilvy, J.K. (2011). Qualitative Rigor or Research Validity in Qualitative Research. *Journal for Specialists in Paediatrics Nursing*, Vol. 16, pp. 151-155.
- Vegholm F. (2011). Relationship Marketing and the Management of Corporate Image in the Bank-SME Relationship. *Management Research Review*, Vol. 34, No. 3, Pp. 325-336.
- Woolley, K. and Risen, J.L. (2018). Closing your Eyes to Follow your Heart: Avoiding Information to Protect a Strong Intuitive Preference. *Journal of personality and social psychology*, Vol. 114, No. 2, p. 230.
- Yang, S.B., Lee, K., Lee, H. and Koo, C. (2019). In Airbnb We Trust: Understanding Consumers' Trust-attachment Building Mechanisms in the Sharing Economy. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 83, pp. 198-209.
- Young, L., & Albaum, G. (2002). Developing a Measure of Trust in Retail Relationships: A Direct Selling Application. UTS School of Marketing Working Paper Series. (pp. 1–27).
- Sun, B., Sun, C., Liu, C. and Gui, C., 2017. Research on initial trust model of mobile banking users. *Journal of Risk Analysis and Crisis Response*, 7(1), pp.13-20.